Status of this Memo

By submitting this Internet-Draft, each author represents that any applicable patent or other IPR claims of which he or she is aware have been or will be disclosed, and any of which he or she becomes aware will be disclosed, in accordance with Section 6 of BCP 79.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF), its areas, and its working groups. Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

The list of current Internet-Drafts can be accessed at http://www.ietf.org/ietf/1id-abstracts.txt

The list of Internet-Draft Shadow Directories can be accessed at http://www.ietf.org/shadow.html.

This Internet-Draft will expire on May 8, 2008.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (C) The IETF Trust (2007).

Abstract

This memo corrects the Augmented Backus-Naur Form (ABNF) production rule associated with generating IPv6 literals in RFC3261

Gurbani & Carpenter Expires May 8, 2008 [Page 1]
Table of Contents

1. Terminology ......................................................... 3
2. Problem statement .................................................. 3
3. Resolution .......................................................... 3
4. Security Considerations ............................................. 4
5. IANA Considerations ................................................ 4
6. Acknowledgments ..................................................... 4
7. References .......................................................... 5
   7.1. Normative References ........................................... 5
   7.2. Informative References ......................................... 5
Authors’ Addresses ..................................................... 5
Intellectual Property and Copyright Statements ................... 7
1. Terminology

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in RFC 2119 [2].

2. Problem statement

The ABNF [4] for generating IPv6 literals in RFC3261 [1] is incorrect. When generating IPv4-mapped IPv6 addresses, the production rule may actually generate the following construct:

[2001:db8::192.0.2.1] - Note the extra colon before the IPv4 address.

The correct construct, of course, would only include two colons before the IPv4 address.

Historically, the ABNF pertaining to IPv6 references in RFC3261 was derived from Appendix B of RFC 2373 [6], which was flawed to begin with (see also RFC2373 errata at http://www.rfc-editor.org/cgi-bin/errataSearch.pl?rfc=2373.). RFC2373 has been subsequently obsoleted by RFC 4291 [5].

The ABNF for IPv6 reference is reproduced from RFC3261 below:

IPv6reference  =  "[" IPv6address "]"
IPv6address    =  hexpart [ ":" IPv4address ]
IPv4address    =  1*3DIGIT "." 1*3DIGIT "." 1*3DIGIT "." 1*3DIGIT
hexpart        =  hexseq / hexseq ":" [ hexseq ] / ":" [ hexseq ]
hexseq         =  hex4 *( ":" hex4)
hex4           =  1*4HEXDIG

Note that the ambiguity occurs in the "IPv6address" production rule where the "IPv4address" non-terminal is prefixed by ":" token. Because the "hexpart" production rule is defined such that two of its alternatives already include the ":" token, this may yield to the faulty construction of an IPv6-mapped IPv4 address with an extra colon when expanding those alternatives.

3. Resolution

The resolution to this ambiguity is simply to use the correct ABNF for the "IPv6address" production rule from Appendix A of RFC3986 [3]. For the sake of completeness, it is reproduced below:
IPv6address = 6( h16 "::" ) ls32
/ "::" 5( h16 "::" ) ls32
/ [ h16 ] "::" 4( h16 "::" ) ls32
/ [ *1( h16 "::" ) h16 ] "::" 3( h16 "::" ) ls32
/ [ *2( h16 "::" ) h16 ] "::" 2( h16 "::" ) ls32
/ [ *3( h16 "::" ) h16 ] "::" h16 "::" ls32
/ [ *4( h16 "::" ) h16 ] "::" ls32
/ [ *5( h16 "::" ) h16 ] "::" h16
/ [ *6( h16 "::" ) h16 ] "::"

h16 = 1*4HEXDIG
ls32 = ( h16 "::" h16 ) / IPv4address
IPv4address = dec-octet "." dec-octet "." dec-octet "." dec-octet
dec-octet = DIGIT ; 0-9
/ %x31-39 DIGIT ; 10-99
/ "1" 2DIGIT ; 100-199
/ "2" %x30-34 DIGIT ; 200-249
/ "25" %x30-35 ; 250-255

Accordingly, following the SIP essential corrections process [7], this memo RECOMMENDS that the "IPv6address" and "IPv4address" production rules be deleted from RFC3261 and replaced with the production rules of the same name in RFC3986 (and reproduced above.) These changes, when made to RFC3261, will make "hexpart", "hexseq", and "hex4" production rules obsolete. Thus this memo RECOMMENDS that the "hexpart", "hexseq", and "hex4" production rules be deleted from the ABNF of RFC3261.

4. Security Considerations

This document does not introduce any new security considerations.

5. IANA Considerations

This document does not include any IANA considerations.

6. Acknowledgments

The correct ABNF for IPv6 was developed by Andrew Main (draft-main-ipaddr-text-rep) in 2005 and published in RFC3986.

7. References
7.1. Normative References


7.2. Informative References


Authors' Addresses

Vijay K. Gurbani (editor)
Bell Laboratories, Alcatel-Lucent
2701 Lucent Lane
Room 9F-546
Lisle, IL 60532
USA

Phone: +1 630 224-0216
Email: vkg at bell hyphen labs dot com
Brian E. Carpenter (editor)
Department of Computer Science
University of Auckland
PB 92019
Auckland,  1142
New Zealand

Email:  brian.e.carpenter@gmail.com