1. Introduction

Legislators writing laws that would limit or prohibit the sending of unsolicited bulk email (UBE) or unsolicited commercial email (UCE) have begun to include rules that require mail servers to include particular wording in the SMTP banner. To date, this wording has had two distinct purposes: to warn senders that they may not send UBE or UCE to that SMTP host, and to state the physical location of the host so that the sender may know which laws apply.

This document is meant to help clarify how such legislation might be worded, and to help increase interoperability of various laws. It is not meant to be a standard of any kind, but is meant only for its informational value.

2. The SMTP Banner

SMTP, as defined in [RFC821], is a client-server protocol that runs over TCP/IP. When the SMTP client connects to the SMTP server, the server TCP immediately emits a banner, also called an "opening message" or "connection greeting". The contents of this banner must be in the ASCII character set, and the banner must be no longer than 512 characters, including the response code, separator, and <CRLF> at the end of the banner.

The banner normally contains software and version information, and often contains other useful debugging information. Most SMTP server products allow the system administrator to specify the contents of the banner. The banner must start with a three-digit status code followed by a space, but the rest of banner is not specified by any existing standard.

3. Rationale for Using the SMTP Banner for Anti-UBE and Anti-UCE Messages

There has been some debate about whether or not the SMTP banner is the best place to put notices to UBE senders.

The arguments in favor of using the SMTP banner include:
- A potential UBE sender uses almost no resources on the part of the SMTP server to find out that UBE is not allowed.

- It is very easy to describe in legislation, and thus is most likely to be upheld in courts if challenged.

- An SMTP client who wants to send UBE does not need to identify itself before determining if the SMTP server will accept such mail.

- It is easy for a mail system administrator to configure and check the SMTP banner.

- Existing banners are typically much shorter than 512 characters, so the addition of a short phrase is unlikely to violate any standard limits.

The arguments against using the SMTP banner include:

- This overloads the semantics of the banner contents.

- This could instead be done with an ESMTP extension.

- Even though the load on the recipient’s mail server is low, any type of banner still represents an admission that the sender is allowed to try to send mail that they know is most likely unwanted to the recipient at the recipient’s expense.

4. Suggested Wording for Legislation Restricting UBE and UCE

Legislation that requires wording in the SMTP banner to indicate that UBE or UCE is not allowed or is restricted on the server should include the exact phrase used. That phrase should be short, succinct, and must not be required to be in a particular position in the SMTP banner. We recommend the phrase "NO UBE" or "NO UCE", in all uppercase characters. Legislation mandating either phrase should specify that the phrase must be preceded by a non-alphanumeric character, and followed by non-alphanumeric character or the end of the banner.

Note that such a phrase will be human-readable, but it is also easily machine-readable if the exact phrase is specified in the legislation. Using such a machine-readable phrase makes it easier for potential UBE senders to avoid problems by having a program check whether or not the mail server accepts UBE before sending the mail. Although the banner phrase should be in uppercase characters, clients should recognize the phrase in any combination of upper- and lowercase characters.

It should also be noted that most languages around the world require characters outside the ASCII character set, but these characters must not be used in an SMTP banner. In such cases, the legislation might choose a phrase for the SMTP banner which does not make sense in the native language of the area in question but is unlikely to appear in a banner for other reasons.

5. Suggested wording for Legislation Stating Server Location

Legislation that requires a server administrator to state the location of the server should use standardized abbreviations for countries and local states or provinces. These locations should be easy to pick out from other information in the SMTP banner.

Legislation that requires that the server identify the country that it is
in should use "C=" followed by the official two-letter country code defined in [ISO3166]. Legislation that requires the server identify the state or province that it is in should use "L=" followed by an officially-accepted abbreviation (if any) for the state or province name. Legislation mandating either type of location should specify that the "C=" or "L=" must be preceded by a non-alphanumeric character, and followed by non-alphanumeric character or the end of the banner.

For instance, in the state of California, such legislation might require the phrase "C=US L=CA" to be included in the banner. (The "C" for country and "L" for location come from the widely-used X.500 directory standard.)

6. Security Considerations

Forcing a mail server to state its location can possibly cause an attacker to gain valuable information about the server or its characteristics.

7. References


8. Authors’ Addresses

Paul Hoffman
Internet Mail Consortium
127 Segre Place
Santa Cruz, CA  95060
phoffman@imc.org

John Levine
IECC
PO Box 727
Trumansburg, NY 14886
johnl@iecc.com