Abstract

This document specifies identifiers and challenges required to enable the Automated Certificate Management Environment (ACME) to issue certificates for use by email users that want to use S/MIME.

Status of This Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the provisions of BCP 78 and BCP 79.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-Drafts is at https://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on January 9, 2020.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2019 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to BCP 78 and the IETF Trust’s Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.
1. Introduction

ACME [RFC8555] is a mechanism for automating certificate management on the Internet. It enables administrative entities to prove effective control over resources like domain names, and automates the process of generating and issuing certificates.

This document describes an extension to ACME for use by S/MIME. Section 3 defines extensions for issuing end user S/MIME [RFC8550] certificates.

2. Conventions Used in This Document

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in [RFC2119].

3. Use of ACME for issuing end user S/MIME certificates

ACME [RFC8555] defines "dns" Identifier Type that is used to verify that a particular entity has control over a domain or specific service associated with the domain. In order to be able to issue end-user S/MIME certificates, ACME needs a new Identifier Type that proves ownership of an email address.

This document defines a new Identifier Type "email" which corresponds to an (all ASCII) email address [RFC5321] or Internationalized Email addresses [RFC6531]. This can be used with S/MIME or other similar service that requires possession of a certificate tied to an email address.

Any identifier of type "email" in a newOrder request MUST NOT have a wildcard ("*"), character in its value.
A new challenge type "email-reply-00" is used with "email" Identifier Type, which provides proof that an ACME client has control over an email address:

1. ACME server generates a "challenge" email message with the subject "ACME: <token-part1>", where <token-part1> is the base64url encoded first part of the token, which contains at least 64 bit of entropy. The challenge email message structure is described in more details in Section 3.1. The second part of the token (token-part2, which also contains at least 64 bit of entropy) is returned over HTTPS [RFC2818] to the ACME client.

2. ACME client concatenates "token-part1" and "token-part2" to create "token", calculates key-authz (as per Section 8.1 of [RFC8555]), then includes the base64url encoded SHA-256 digest [FIPS180-4] of the key authorization in the body of a response email message containing a single text/plain MIME body part [RFC2045]. The response email message structure is described in more details in Section 3.2.

For an identifier of type "email", CSR MUST contain the request email address in an extensionRequest attribute [RFC2985] requesting a subjectAltName extension.

3.1. ACME challenge email

A "challenge" email message MUST have the following structure:

1. The message Subject header field has the following syntax: "ACME: <token-part1>", where the prefix "ACME:" is followed by folding white space (FWS, see [RFC5322]) and then by <token-part1> is the base64url encoded first part of the ACME token that MUST be at least 64 octet long after decoding. Due to recommended 78 octet line length limit in [RFC5322], the subject line can be folded, so whitespaces (if any) within the <token-part1> MUST be ignored. [RFC2231] encoding of subject MUST be supported, but when used, only "UTF-8" and "US-ASCII" charsets MUST be used (i.e. other charsets MUST NOT be used).

2. The message MUST include the "Auto-Submitted: auto-generated" header field [RFC3834]. It MAY include optional parameters as allowed by syntax of Auto-Submitted header field.

3. In order to prove authenticity of a challenge message, it MUST be either DKIM [RFC6376] signed or S/MIME [RFC8551] signed. If DKIM signing is used, the resulting DKIM-Signature header field MUST contain the "h=" tag that includes at least "From", "To", "Subject", "Content-Type" and "Message-ID" header fields.
4. If S/MIME signing is not used to prove authenticity of the challenge message, then the message MUST have a single text/plain MIME body part [RFC2045], that contains human readable explanation of the purpose of the message. If S/MIME signing is used, then the text/plain message is used to construct a multipart/signed or "application/pkcs7-mime; smime-type=signed-data;". Either way, it MUST use S/MIME header protection.

Example ACME "challenge" email

Auto-Submitted: auto-generated
Date: Sat, 1 Sep 2018 10:08:55 +0100
Message-ID: <A2299BB.FF7788@example.org>
From: acme-generator@example.org
To: alexey@example.com
Subject: ACME: <base64url-encoded-token-with-64-octets-of-entropy>
Content-Type: text/plain
MIME-Version: 1.0

This is an automatically generated ACME challenge for email address "alexey@example.com". If you haven’t requested an S/MIME certificate generation for this email address, be very afraid. If you did request it, your email client might be able to process this request automatically, or you might have to paste the first token part into an external program.

Figure 1

3.2. ACME response email

A "response" email message MUST have the following structure:

1. The message Subject header field has the following syntax: "Re: ACME: <token-part1>", where the string "ACME:" is followed by folding white space (FWS, see [RFC5322]) and then by <token-part1> is the base64url encoded first part of the ACME token that MUST be at least 64 octet long after decoding. Due to recommended 78 octet line length limit in [RFC5322], the subject line can be folded, so whitespaces (if any) within the <token-part1> MUST be ignored. [RFC2231] encoding of subject MUST be supported, but when used, only "UTF-8" and "US-ASCII" charsets MUST be used (i.e. other charsets MUST NOT be used).

2. The From: header field contains the email address of the user that is requesting S/MIME certificate issuance.
3. The To: header field of the response contains the value from the From: header field of the challenge email.

4. The Cc: header field is ignored if present in the "response" email message.

5. The message MUST have a single text/plain MIME body part [RFC2045], containing base64url encoded SHA-256 digest [FIPS180-4] of the key authorization, calculated based on token-part1 (received over email) and token-part2 (received over HTTPS). Note that due to historic line length limitations in email, line endings (CRLFs) can be freely inserted in the middle of the encoded digest, so they MUST be ignored when processing it.

6. There is no need to use any Content-Transfer-Encoding other than 7bit, however use of Quoted-Printable or base64 is not prohibited in a "response" email message.

Example ACME "response" email

Date: Sat, 1 Sep 2018 11:12:00 +0100
Message-ID: <111-22222-3333333@example.com>
From: alexey@example.com
To: acme-generator@example.org
Subject: Re: ACME: <base64url-encoded-token-with-64-octets-of-entropy>
Content-Type: text/plain
MIME-Version: 1.0
LoqXcYV8q5ONbJQxbmR7SCTNo3tiAXDfowy
jxAjEuX0.9jg46WB3rrr_AHD-EBXdN7cBkH1WOu0tA3M9
fm21mqTI

Figure 2

4. Open Issues

[[This section should be empty before publication]]

1. Do we need to handle text/html or multipart/alternative in email challenge? Simplicity suggests "no". However, for automated processing it might be better to use at least multipart/mixed with a special MIME type.

2. How to verify authenticity of "response" email messages? We can’t require use of S/MIME, as this protocol is used for S/MIME user enrollment. However DKIM/SPF/DMARC can be recommended.
3. Define a new parameter to "Auto-Submitted: auto-generated", so that it is easier to figure out that a particular message is an ACME challenge message?

5. IANA Considerations

IANA is requested to register a new Identifier Type "email" which corresponds to an (all ASCII) email address [RFC5321] or Internationalized Email addresses [RFC6531].

And finally, IANA is requested to register the following ACME challenge types that are used with Identifier Type "email": "email-reply". The reference for it is this document.

6. Security Considerations

TBD.

7. Normative References


Appendix A. Acknowledgements

Thank you to Andreas Schulze and Gerd v. Egidy for suggestions, comments and corrections on this document.

Author’s Address

Alexey Melnikov
Isode Ltd
14 Castle Mews
Hampton, Middlesex TW12 2NP
UK

EMail: alexey.melnikov@isode.com