E-mail Authentication for Internationalized Mail
draft-ietf-dmarc-eauth-06

Abstract

SPF (RFC7208), DKIM (RFC6376), and DMARC (RFC7489) enable a domain
owner to publish e-mail authentication and policy information in the
DNS. In internationalized e-mail, domain names can occur both as
U-labels and A-labels. This specification updates the SPF, DKIM, and
DMARC specifications to clarify which form of internationalized
domain names to use in those specifications.

Status of This Memo

This Internet-Draft is submitted in full conformance with the
provisions of BCP 78 and BCP 79.

Internet-Drafts are working documents of the Internet Engineering
Task Force (IETF). Note that other groups may also distribute
working documents as Internet-Drafts. The list of current Internet-
Drafts is at https://datatracker.ietf.org/drafts/current/.

Internet-Drafts are draft documents valid for a maximum of six months
and may be updated, replaced, or obsoleted by other documents at any
time. It is inappropriate to use Internet-Drafts as reference
material or to cite them other than as "work in progress."

This Internet-Draft will expire on October 13, 2019.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2019 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the
document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to BCP 78 and the IETF Trust’s Legal
Provisions Relating to IETF Documents
(https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info) in effect on the date of
publication of this document. Please review these documents
carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect
to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must
include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of
the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

Table of Contents

1. Introduction ............................................... 2
2. Definitions ................................................. 3
3. General principles ......................................... 3
4. SPF and internationalized mail ............................ 3
5. DKIM and internationalized mail ............................ 4
6. DMARC and internationalized mail .......................... 5
7. IANA Considerations ....................................... 5
8. Security Considerations .................................... 5
9. Normative References ..................................... 5
Appendix A. Change history ................................... 6
Author's Address ............................................. 7

1. Introduction

SPF [RFC7208], DKIM [RFC6376], and DMARC [RFC7489] enable a domain owner to publish e-mail authentication and policy information in the DNS. SPF primarily publishes information about what host addresses are authorized to send mail for a domain. DKIM places cryptographic signatures on e-mail messages, with the validation keys published in the DNS. DMARC publishes policy information related to the domain in the From: header field of e-mail messages.

In conventional e-mail, all domain names are ASCII in all contexts so there is no question about the representation of the domain names. All internationalized domain names are represented as A-labels [RFC5890] in message header fields, in SMTP sessions, and in the DNS.

Internationalized mail [RFC6530], (generally called EAI for E-mail Address Internationalization), allows U-labels in SMTP sessions [RFC6531] and in message header fields [RFC6532].

Every U-label is equivalent to an A-label, so in principle the choice of label format will not cause ambiguities. But in practice, consistent use of label formats will make it more likely that mail senders’ and receivers’ code interoperates.

Internationalized mail also allows UTF-8 encoded Unicode characters in the local parts of mailbox names, which were historically only ASCII.
2. Definitions

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "NOT RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in BCP 14 [RFC2119] [RFC8174] when, and only when, they appear in all capitals, as shown here.

The term IDN, for Internationalized Domain Name, refers to a domain name containing either U-labels or A-labels.

Since DMARC is not currently a standards track protocol, this specification offers advice rather than requirements for DMARC.

3. General principles

In headers in EAI mail messages, domain names that were restricted to ASCII can be U-labels, and mailbox local parts can be UTF-8. Header field names and other text intended primarily to be interpreted by computers rather than read by people remains ASCII.

Strings stored in DNS records remain ASCII since there is no way to tell whether a client retrieving a DNS record expects an EAI or an ASCII result. When a domain name found in a mail header field includes U-labels, those labels are translated to A-labels before being looked up in the DNS, as described in [RFC5891].

4. SPF and internationalized mail

SPF [RFC7208] uses two identities from the SMTP session, the host name in the EHLO command, and the domain in the address in the MAIL FROM command. Since the EHLO command precedes the server response that tells whether the server supports the SMTPUTF8 extension, an IDN host name MUST be represented as A-labels. An IDN in MAIL FROM can be either U-labels or A-labels.

All U-labels MUST be converted to A-labels before being used for an SPF validation. This includes both the original DNS lookup, described in Section 3 of [RFC7208] and the macro expansion of domain-spec described in section 7. Section 4.3 of [RFC7208] states that all IDNs in an SPF DNS record MUST be A-labels; this rule is unchanged since any SPF record can be used to authorize either EAI or conventional mail.

SPF macros %{s} and %{l} expand the local-part of the sender’s mailbox. If the local-part contains non-ASCII characters, terms that include %{s} or %{l} do not match anything, because non-ASCII local parts cannot be used as the DNS labels the macros are intended to
match. Since these macros are rarely used, this is unlikely to be an issue in practice.

5. DKIM and internationalized mail

DKIM [RFC6376] specifies a mail header field that contains a cryptographic message signature and a DNS record that contains the validation key.

Section 2.11 of [RFC6376] defines dkim-quoted-printable. Its definition is modified in messages with internationalized header fields so that non-ASCII UTF-8 characters need not be quoted. The ABNF for dkim-safe-char in those messages is replaced by the following, adding non-ASCII UTF-8 characters from [RFC3629]:

\[
\text{dkim-safe-char} = \%x21-3A / \%x3C / \%x3E-7E / \text{UTF8-2} / \text{UTF8-3} / \text{UTF8-4} \]
\[
; '!' - ':' , '<', '>', '-' , non-ASCII
\]

Section 3.5 of [RFC6376] states that IDNs in the d=, i=, and s= tags of a DKIM-Signature header field MUST be encoded as A-labels. This rule is relaxed only for internationalized messages header fields [RFC6532] so IDNs SHOULD be represented as U-labels. This provides improved consistency with other header fields. (A-labels remain valid to allow a transition from older software.) The set of allowable characters in the local-part of an i= tag is extended in the same fashion as local parts of e-mail addresses as described in section 3.2 of [RFC6532]. When computing or verifying the hash in a DKIM signature as described in section 3.7, the hash MUST use the domain name in the format it occurs in the header field.

Section 3.4.2 of [RFC6376] describes relaxed header canonicalization. Its first step converts all header field names from upper case to lower case. Field names are restricted to printable ASCII (see [RFC5322] section 3.6.8) so this case conversion remains ASCII case conversion.

DKIM key records, described in section 3.6.1, do not contain domain names, so there is no change to their specification.
6. DMARC and internationalized mail

DMARC [RFC7489] defines a policy language that domain owners can specify for the domain of the address in a RFC5322.From header field.

Section 6.6.1 specifies, somewhat imprecisely, how IDNs in the RFC5322.From address domain are to be handled. That section is updated to say that all U-labels in the domain are converted to A-labels before further processing. Section 7.1 is similarly updated to say that all U-labels in domains being handled are converted to A-labels before further processing.

DMARC policy records, described in sections 6.3 and 7.1, can contain e-mail addresses in the rua and ruf tags. Since a policy record can be used for both internationalized and conventional mail, those addresses still have to be conventional addresses, not internationalized addresses.

7. IANA Considerations

This document makes no request of IANA.

8. Security Considerations

E-mail is subject to a vast range of threats and abuses. This document attempts to slightly mitigate some of them but does not, as far as the author knows, add any new ones. The updates to SPF, DKIM, and DMARC are intended to allow the respective specifications work as reliably on internationalized mail as they do on ASCII mail, so that applications that use them, such as some kinds of spam and phish filtering, can work more reliably on internationalized mail.

9. Normative References


Appendix A. Change history

05 to 06 more editorial nits

04 to 05 editorial nits
03 to 04  remove dangling A-R reference, add more i18nish and security goodness
02 to 03  minor edits per Alexey
01 to 02  update references
00 to 01  Relaxed canon, Typos
00 First WG version

Author’s Address

John Levine
Taughannock Networks
PO Box 727
Trumansburg, NY 14886

Email: standards@taugh.com
URI: http://jl.ly