TFTP Option Negotiation Analysis

Status of this Memo

This memo provides information for the Internet community. This memo does not specify an Internet standard of any kind. Distribution of this memo is unlimited.

Abstract

The TFTP option negotiation mechanism, proposed in [1], is a backward-compatible extension to the TFTP protocol, defined in [2]. It allows file transfer options to be negotiated prior to the transfer using a mechanism which is consistent with TFTP’s Request Packet format. The mechanism is kept simple by enforcing a request-respond-acknowledge sequence, similar to the lock-step approach taken by TFTP itself.

This document was written to allay concerns that the presence of options in a TFTP Request packet might cause pathological behavior on servers which do not support TFTP option negotiation.

Test Results

A TFTP client, modified to send TFTP options, was tested against five unmodified servers:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DEC</th>
<th>DEC 3000/400 alpha</th>
<th>OSF1 V3.0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SGI</td>
<td>IP17 mips</td>
<td>IRIX 5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUN</td>
<td>sun4c sparc</td>
<td>SunOS 5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBM</td>
<td>RS/6000 Model 320</td>
<td>AIX 3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUN</td>
<td>sun4m</td>
<td>SunOS 4.1.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In each case, the servers ignored the option information in the Request packet and the transfer proceeded as though no option negotiation had been attempted. In addition, the standard BSD4.3 source for TFTPd, the starting point for many implementations, was examined. The code clearly ignores any extraneous information in Request packets.

From these results and examinations, it is clear that the TFTP option
negotiation mechanism is fully backward-compatible with unmodified TFTP servers.

Security Considerations

Security issues are not discussed in this memo.

References


Related Documents


Authors' Addresses

Gary Scott Malkin
Xylogics, Inc.
53 Third Avenue
Burlington, MA  01803

Phone:  (617) 272-8140
EMail:  gmalkin@xylogics.com

Art Harkin
Internet Services Project
Information Networks Division
19420 Homestead Road MS 43LN
Cupertino, CA  95014

Phone: (408) 447-3755
EMail:  ash@cup.hp.com